

# Journal of Human Resource and Leadership (JHRL)

## INFLUENCE OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION ON RETENTION OF TEACHERS SERVICE COMMISSION SECRETARIAT STAFF IN BUSIA COUNTY, KENYA

Esther Tawarar\*,<sup>2</sup> Dr. Sylvia C. Sirai, PhD <sup>3</sup>Dr Victor  
Lusala Aliata, PhD



**INFLUENCE OF RECRUITMENT AND SELECTION ON RETENTION OF  
TEACHERS SERVICE COMMISSION SECRETARIAT STAFF IN BUSIA  
COUNTY, KENYA**

**Authors:**

**<sup>1</sup>Esther Tawarar\*,<sup>2</sup>Dr. Sylvia C. Sirai, PhD <sup>3</sup>Dr Victor Lusala Aliata, PhD**

**Address for correspondence:**

- 1. Masters Student, Department of Business Administration and Management, Kibabii University, Bungoma, Kenya**
- 2. Lecturer, Department of Business Administration and Management, Kibabii University, Bungoma, Kenya Lecturer,**
- 3. Lecturer, Faculty of Business and Economics, Tom Mboya University College, Homabay, Kenya**

**Abstract**

**Purpose:** Employee retention has been a key source of competitive advantage as well as achievement of business goals and objectives. Employee turnover can have a detrimental influence on the implementation of business strategies and eventually lead to productivity reduction. The secretariat staff labour turnover at the Teachers Service Commission (TSC) has for years increased and this has affected the overall performance at the TSC since qualified employees with experience leave the TSC yearly. For example, in 2018, the recorded turnover of employees was at 20% and the efficiency of TSC fell by 5%. The purpose of the study was to establish the influence of recruitment and selection on retention of Teachers Service Commission secretariat staff in Busia County, Kenya.

**Methodology:** Human Capital and Motivation theories served as the foundation for this study. In this study, a descriptive research design was used. The target population was 115 employees working at the TSC in Busia County as secretariat staff. The sample size was 115 according to Slovincs, (1980).

**Findings:** The findings revealed that recruitment and selection had a positive significant effect on retention ( $\beta=.408$ ,  $p<.05$ ). The study concluded that HRM practices have a positive influence on employee retention.

**Unique Contribution to Theory, Practice and Policy:** The output of the research may be utilized by the Department of HRM practices at the TSC Kenya, by employers, academicians, employees, trade unions, HR practitioners, Ministry of Labour in the formulation of a systematic process of ensuring employee retention at work places. The outcome may also lead to efficient and effective service delivery as well as proper utilization of resources by all the departments at the TSC offices in Kenya.

**Keywords:** *Recruitment, selection, employee retention, secretariat staff.*

## INTRODUCTION

The employment environment nowadays is very competitive and requires an organization to have committed workforce that collectively work to realize organization goals (Coetzem, 2005). Employee retention is important in any organization. Employees being the organization's biggest assets use their imagination and effort to accomplish everyday business activities (Armstrong, 2009). Employee retention (ER) has evolved in different directions over the last decade, and many research have been performed on the subject, as well as expertise in these areas (Brown *et al.*, 2011).

Researches derived from social sciences indicate a wider consent amongst observers that employee job retention leads to enhanced performance, output, and service excellence in the organization (Owoyemiet *al*, 2011). The capacity of a company to retain its workers for a longer length of time through various ways has been termed as the ER. It also refer to the number of current employees that remain or stay in their positions for a set amount of time. The goal of a retention strategy should be to keep high-performing and skilled workers (Blake, 2009). The ER in an organization is highly regarded as it addresses lateness, absenteeism commitment and turnover among the human resources. Hence, has a potentially serious consequence for overall organization performance.

Employee retention, according to Armstrong (2006), refers to policies as well as programs aimed at ensuring that an organization's productive employees stay with the company for a long time. As a result, retention programs are created to guarantee that employees remain dedicated to the business. Employee retention, according to Taplin and Winterton (2007), is the capacity of management to maintain personnel for a longer length of time. It requires favorable HRM policies and procedures that allow important workers to be committed to a business, therefore lowering turnover. As a result, employees' knowledge and talents are important to a company's ability to compete economically and keeping skilled individuals favorable to them. Organizations utilize many methods to keep their workers, such as salary, training and development, a competing work environment, as well as other benefits. (Samuel and Chipunza, 2009).

### Statement of the problem

The secretariat staff labour turnover at the TSC has for years increased and this has affected its operations. For example in 2018, the employees' turnover stood at 20% and the efficiency of the organizational fell to 5%. Lack of employee training, poor remuneration, undermining the HR officers, overworking due to shortage of staff, outsourcing, and lack of promotions to trained personnel and frequent changes in policies and organization structure amongst others has affected retention of TSC secretariat staff in Busia County (TSC Image magazine volume 19, 2016). Busia County is in Western region of Kenya and is one of the counties amongst 47 counties in Kenya that TSC decentralized its services to. Busia County has a total of 115 secretariat staff who serves the seven (7) sub counties with 12,000 teachers. This represents a serious secretariat staff shortage that TSC has overlooked for years. A change in policy has affected career progression of the secretariat staff. This has discouraged workforce training and development. TSC has always outsourced employees instead of promoting the existing ones hence demoralizing the existing staff who qualify for the advertized posts (TSC Annual Report, 2016). Despite the fact that employee retention has been extensively researched, several myths have been debunked via numerous studies. It is a common misunderstanding that only remuneration as an HRM strategy can retain employees regardless of the industry in which they work. This is not the case. Front-line supervisors have been misled by this notion. As a result, industrial personnel are more concerned with other HRM practices that their managers regarded as unimportant. Employee productivity and retention issues are currently emerging as the most critical employment

management concerns, owing to employee commitment, company restructuring activities, and fierce competition for key personnel. Unexpected employee absence may have a significant influence on the execution of a company strategy and eventually lead to a decrease in productivity in many companies. Based on the foregoing empirical studies by Ali (2010), Fredrick (2010), Edward (2010), Premeaux (2000), Paulet *al.* (2009), Duncan (2008), Maxwell (2010) and Phillip (2009) among others conducted to establish the influence of HRM practices on retention of employees seem to be inconclusive hence the need for this study. It is in this regard that this study sought to explore how human resource practices influence retention of secretariat staff of the TSC in Busia County.

## LITERATURE REVIEW

### **Influence of Recruitment and Selection on Employee Retention**

Sutanto and Kurniawan (2016) investigated the impact of recruitment, retention, and labor relations on employee performance in Indonesia's Solo Batik industry. A sample of 375 respondents was used who were obtained using slovin formula from the target population of 715 respondents and the instrument for data collection was the questionnaire. This was because the questionnaires were able to reach quite a number of people within a short time. Collected data was analysed using the simple regression where the means of the variables were regressed against the mean of employee performance. According to the findings of this study, recruiting, retention, as well as labor relations all have a substantial impact on employee performance. Recruitment and staff retention, on the other hand, were found to have a substantial impact on employee performance. In addition to recruiting and staff retention, labor relations discovered substantial influence on employee retention. According to the findings, labor relations have a significant effect on employee performance through recruiting and employee retention. Furthermore, through employee retention, recruiting has a significant influence on labor relations. The company may establish a Batik academy in order to regenerate and train professional personnel among the next generation ready to enter the industrial sector, as well as to revitalize batik, which is currently old.

Ntiamoahet *al.* (2014) examined the recruitment and selection practices and organizational performance in a Revenue Authority organization in Ghana. This was published under International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management; UK. The 160 employees targeted were those working in the Revenue Authority in different positions and therefore, had acquired different experiences. Data was collected by structured questionnaire. Structured questionnaires were used to gather data, which were delivered to respondents with the assistance of research assistants. After that, the respondents' questionnaires were gathered, sorted, and input into SPSS version 20.0. Findings indicated that employee retention was still a challenge and that there was need to improve particularly recruitment since it was found to be low and therefore affected employee retention. It was recommended that competitive and rigorous recruitment and selection practices be implemented.

In Nigeria, Ekwoabaet *al.* (2015) looked at how recruitment and selection standards affected the banking sector, in Lagos Nigeria. The researchers used Fidelity Bank as a point of reference. The respondents used in the study were 130 out of 132 respondents (98.48% response rate) who were randomly selected. Primary information was obtained using structured questionnaires. Descriptive survey research design was adopted. Data collected was analysed using the Chi Square which determined relatedness of the hypotheses. The study concluded that recruitment and selection processes be enhanced in the banking sectors to realize employee retention and better overall performance since the quality and the quantity of the human resource determines the performance and the future of the firm.

However, it was recommended that the banks should evaluate their selection methods based on their validity, impartiality, scope of usage, and cost.

Ramki (2015) conducted another research on how recruiting and selection methods impact teacher retention at International Primary Schools in Nairobi County. The design employed was descriptive research which enabled description of items under study and helped the researcher to use the questionnaires to collect primary data. A total of fifty (50) schools were selected where three (3) respondents from each of these schools were purposively chosen. This gave a total of 150 respondents. The questionnaires were distributed to the respondents who were mainly the Directors and the Head/principals of schools. A total of one hundred and twenty eight (128) questionnaires were returned out of the 150 questionnaires which were given out. Findings of the study illustrated that recruitment and selection practices and employee retention in International Primary Schools were highly correlated. It was recommended that good channels of communications on recruitment and selection should be enhanced to improve on the employee retention. Suggestions for further study should be carried out on the recruitment and selection practices and employee performance in Public Secondary Schools in Nairobi County.

Irunguet *al.* (2019) while working on Paper Project in Kibra Sub-County, Nairobi County, Kenya endeavoured to determine the link between recruitment and selection practices on staff retention. Primary information was obtained using structured questionnaires. Descriptive survey research design was adopted. Data collected was analysed using descriptive statistics. The census study was used where all of 60 respondents were used. Findings of the study illustrated that though recruitment and selection were in place, but they were not diversified especially on recruitment where all platforms like internet, media, whatsapp and websites could be used so that information on vacancies reach wide spectrum of people.

## **RESEARCH METHODOLOGY**

### **Research Design**

This study adopted correlational research design (Creswell, 2003). This design sought to establish the associations of HRM practices and employee retention of TSC secretariat employees in Busia County. Design enabled the researcher to test the research hypotheses

### **Target Population**

Focus of the study was on all the 115 secretariat employees of the TSC in Busia County (Busia County, 2018). It mainly targeted on various departments at the TSC Busia County Office.

**Table 1 Target Population**

| S/N          | Respondents Categories      | Target Population |
|--------------|-----------------------------|-------------------|
| 1            | County Directors            | 2                 |
| 2            | Sub County Directors        | 7                 |
| 3            | Sub County HR Officers      | 7                 |
| 4            | ICT Officers                | 16                |
| 5            | Accountants                 | 2                 |
| 6            | Human Resource Assistants   | 8                 |
| 7            | Secretaries                 | 10                |
| 8            | Curriculum Support Officers | 25                |
| 9            | Clerical Officers           | 28                |
| 10           | Subordinate Staff           | 10                |
| <b>Total</b> |                             | <b>115</b>        |

*Source: TSC County Human Resource Department (2020)*

According to TSC County Human Resource Department (2020) in Busia County, there are 115 secretariat employees. The Study targeted secretariat staff drawn from various departments of the TSC Busia County as in Table 1..

### **Data Collection Instrument**

Structured (closed-ended) questionnaires were used to obtain primary data from respondents. According to Kothari, (2003) questionnaires aided in collection of correct and consistent data since responses are given at liberty devoid of any influence. According to Fox and Bayat, (2007) questionnaire is an inventory of questions on a particular subject put together to seek information on the respective subject. The use of questionnaire is economical, efficient in analysis, popular with majority of individuals, minimizes unfairness and thought as less invasive (Fox and Bayat, 2007). The questionnaire included scale-like questions (like-scale) to assess the respondents' degree of rating. The questionnaire was divided into sections, with the first component focusing on the overall demographics of the population, the second section to fourth section covered questions on HRM practices and the final section of the questionnaire is general detailing how committed employees are to their organization.

### **Data Analysis**

Data from the field was cleaned, Sorted-grouped according to study, coded and input for analysis under Statistical Package for Social Science (SPSS) version 20.0 for prediction of graphs, tables, frequencies and percentage distribution. To determine the relationships between independent and dependent variables, regression and correlation analyses were used. Because the dependent variable is metric and single, the researcher opted to utilize multiple regressions. The F-test was employed in the study to test the research hypotheses. Analysis of variance was also performed to examine the sample's variance. This was accomplished with the aid of SPSS, quantitative analysis software.

## **RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS**

### **Recruitment and Selection**

The study sought to measure respondent's views on recruitment and selection using questionnaire statements on a five point likert scale ranging from strongly disagree to strongly agree. Table 2 displays the results using frequency counts, percentages, means, as well as standard deviations.

**Table 2 Views on Recruitment and Selection**

| Statements  | SD     | D      | NDA      | A        | SA       | MEAN(S<br>D) |
|---|--------|--------|----------|----------|----------|--------------|
| Internal recruitment and selection increases employee retention                                 | 0(0.0) | 1(0.9) | 9(8.3)   | 30(27.8) | 68(63)   | 4.5(0.69)    |
| Promotions enhance employee retention   | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 2(1.9)   | 35(32.4) | 71(65.7) | 4.6(0.52)    |
| The opportunity to participate in recruitment and selection programs enhance employee retention | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 25(23.1) | 57(52.8) | 26(24.1) | 4(0.69)      |
| Internal recruitment and selection helps motivate employees and increase their productivity     | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 12(11.1) | 32(29.6) | 64(59.3) | 4.5(0.69)    |
| Transparency in recruitment and selection increases employee retention                          | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 1(0.9)   | 46(42.6) | 61(56.5) | 4.6(0.52)    |
| Non-discrimination in recruitment and selection enhances their retention and performance        | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 2(1.9)   | 46(42.6) | 60(55.6) | 4.5(0.54)    |
| Orientation of new employees enhance retention  | 0(0.0) | 2(1.9) | 38(35.2) | 47(43.5) | 21(19.4) | 3.8(0.77)    |
| Employee motivation to learn enhances organization performance                                  | 0(0.0) | 0(0.0) | 3(2.8)   | 46(42.6) | 59(54.6) | 4.5(0.56)    |
| There is a relationship between recruitment & selection and retention                           | 0(0.0) | 2(1.9) | 20(18.5) | 42(38.9) | 44(40.7) | 4.2(0.8)     |

The findings in Table 2 shows that majority of the respondents, 68(63.0%) strongly agreed that internal recruitment and selection increases employee retention, which was supported by 30(27.8%) who agreed on the same. Therefore, approximately 90% of the respondents agreed that internal recruitments and selection increases employee retention. Using averages and standard deviations, the findings showed that internal recruitment highly ( $M=4.5$ ,  $SD=.69$ ) increased employee retention. Promotion was also found to enhance employee retention as indicated by majority, 71(65.7%) of the respondents who strongly agreed on the same, with a mean and standard deviation of ( $M=4.6$ ,  $SD=.52$ ). Furthermore, the findings shows that the opportunity to participate in recruitment and selection programs enhance employee retention as revealed by 57(52.8%) of the respondents who agreed and 26(24.1%) who strongly agreed.

Internal recruitment and selection helps motivate employees and increases their productivity highly ( $M=4.5$ ,  $SD=.69$ ) as indicated by majority, 64(59.3%) who strongly agreed and 32(29.6%) who agreed. It was also found that transparency in recruitment and selection highly ( $M=4.6$ ,  $SD=.52$ ) increases employee retention, to which majority, 61(56.5%) of the respondents strongly agreed and 46(42.6%) agreed. It is also clear that non-discrimination in recruitment and selection enhances their retention and performance to a high extend ( $M=4.5$ ,  $SD=.54$ ) as indicated by majority, 60(55.6%) of the respondents who strongly and supported by 46(42.6%) of the respondents who agreed.

It emerged that orientation of new employees enhanced retention moderately ( $M=3.8$ ,  $SD=.77$ ), which was also confirmed by majority, 47(43.5%) of the respondents who agreed and were supported by 21(19.4%) of the respondents who strongly agreed. The findings indicates that employee motivation to learn enhances organization performance highly ( $M=4.5$ ,  $SD=.56$ ) as indicated by majority, 59(54.6%) who strongly agreed and were supported by 46(42.6%) who agreed on the same. Finally, the findings shows that there is a moderate ( $M=4.2$ ,  $SD=.8$ ) relationship between recruitment, selection and retention as indicated by majority, 44(40.7%) of the respondents who strongly agreed and 42(38.9%) who agreed on the same.

These findings imply that that recruitment and selection plays an important role in employee retention of TSC secretariat staff of Busia County. By motivation, participation, promotions and orientation of new employees, there is higher possibility of retention which might improve the service delivery in TSC. Therefore according to the respondents' rating, employee recruitment and selection enhances retention. Other similar studies, which include the likes of Sutanto and Kurniawan (2016), Ntiamoahet *al.* (2014) and Ekwoaba et al. (2015), have found almost similar results thus implying that the present findings affirm the possibility of retention due to employee recruitment and selection.

Further analysis of the relationship between the two variables and consequent influence of Recruitment and Selection on retention of TSC secretariat staff in Busia County was also carried out using simple linear regression model. The null hypothesis of the study was that "Recruitment and selection have no significant influence on retention of TSC secretariat staff in Busia County" which was tested and the findings presented as shown in Table 4.3 as follows.

To determine the impact of recruiting and selection on retention, the following basic linear regression model was used, with retention as the dependent variable and recruitment and selection as the independent variables. The findings are presented as shown below in Table 3.

**Table 3 Influence of Recruitment and Selection on Retention**

| Model | R                 | R Square | Adjusted R Square | Std. Error of the Estimate | R Square Change | Change Statistics |     |     |               |
|-------|-------------------|----------|-------------------|----------------------------|-----------------|-------------------|-----|-----|---------------|
|       |                   |          |                   |                            |                 | F Change          | df1 | df2 | Sig. F Change |
| 1     | .392 <sup>a</sup> | .154     | .146              | .92408645                  | .154            | 19.302            | 1   | 106 | .000          |

a. Predictors: (Constant), Recruitment and selection

| Model |                           | Unstandardized Coefficients |            | Standardized Coefficients<br>Beta | t     | Sig. |
|-------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|------------|-----------------------------------|-------|------|
|       |                           | B                           | Std. Error |                                   |       |      |
| 1     | (Constant)                | .003                        | .089       |                                   | .034  | .973 |
| 1     | Recruitment and selection | .409                        | .093       | .392                              | 4.393 | .000 |

a. Dependent Variable: Retention

| ANOVA <sup>a</sup> |            |                |     |             |        |                   |
|--------------------|------------|----------------|-----|-------------|--------|-------------------|
| Model              |            | Sum of Squares | Df  | Mean Square | F      | Sig.              |
| 1                  | Regression | 3.456          | 1   | 3.456       | 19.302 | .000 <sup>b</sup> |
|                    | Residual   | 18.980         | 106 | .179        |        |                   |
|                    | Total      | 22.437         | 107 |             |        |                   |

a. Dependent Variable: Retention

b. Predictors: (Constant), Zscore: Recruitment and selection

The findings in Table 3 shows that there is a significant correlation between recruitment and selection and retention ( $R=.392$ ), implying that retention is positively associated with recruitment and selection. In addition, the findings shows that recruitment and selection accounted for a 15.4% significant variance in retention, ( $R\text{ square}=.154$ ,  $F(1,106)=19.302$ ,  $P<.01$ ). Furthermore, the findings using model coefficients shows that recruitment and selection positively and significantly contributed to the retention ( $\beta=.392$ ,  $p<.01$ ). This indicates that for every one unit increase in recruiting and selection, the retention of TSC secretariat personnel in Busia County improves by .392 units. We reject the null hypothesis and propose an alternative hypothesis that claims there is a large effect of recruiting and selection on retention, based on the positive and significant contribution as well as the

significant variation accounted for by recruitment and selection on retention. These findings are consistent with those of Sutanto and Kurniawan (2016), who discovered that employee recruitment, retention, and labor relations had a substantial impact on employee performance. Ntiamoah *et al.* (2014) as well as Ekwoaba *et al.* (2015) also found a positive link between recruitment & selection and performance. Therefore following these overwhelming support for the findings, it can be concluded that there is a positive and significant relationship.

## **SUMMARY, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS**

Recruitment and selection was measured using various statements which included transparency, non-discrimination and promotions among others. The findings established that these were practiced to a high extent and were perceived by the respondents. Using simple linear regression model, recruitment and selection accounted for the highest significant variance in retention and uniquely contributed to retention. As compared to the other variables, recruitment and selection contributed the most significant effect.

Recruitment and selection is an important process for determining the tendency of employees to stay or move out. A proper recruitment will leave a good impact in employees' lifetime at the workplace. Following the findings, there is a significant effect of recruitment and selection on employee retention. In Busia County, recruitment and selection of the TSC secretariat staff is well done and therefore highly contributes to the retention of the staff. Therefore recruitment and selection has a high influence on the retention of TSC staff in among the Busia county secretariat.

It was established that recruitment and selection positively contribute to the retention of employees. However, the best practices are not done thus leading to poor recruitment and selection. This study recommends that the efforts be improved to ensure proper recruitment and selection processes so as to improve retention.

## **REFERENCES**

- Ali, A. J. (2010). Islamic challenges to HR in modern organizations. *Personnel Review*.
- Armstrong, M. (2009). *Armstrong's handbook of performance management: An evidence based guide to delivering high performance*. Kogan Page Publishers.
- Blake, D. M. (2009). *Creating generationally specific engagement strategies based on need satisfaction* (Doctoral dissertation, Capella University).
- Brown, S., McHardy, J., McNabb, R., & Taylor, K. (2011). Workplace performance, worker commitment, and loyalty. *Journal of Economics & Management Strategy*, 20(3), 925-955.
- Busia County, K. (2018). Teacher Demand Driven Policy: Implications on Retention and Equity in the Distribution of Teachers in Secondary Schools in. *management*, 9(32).
- Creswell, J. W. (2003). *Educational research: Planning, conducting, and evaluating quantitative* (p. 676). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall.
- Duncan, G. (2008). Employees Turnover and organization Profitability. *Journal of Human Resource Management*, 12.
- Edward, C. (2010). Cost of Employees Turnover. *Journal of Management*, 22.
- Ekabu, P. K. (2020). Professional Development Opportunities as a determinant of Turnover Intention: A case of teachers in Public Secondary Schools in Meru County, Kenya. *Technium Soc. Sci. J.*, 11, 36.

- Ekwobaet (2015). Influence of promotional prospects on turnover intentions of public secondary school teachers in Meru County. *European Scientific Journal*, 14(25), 27-36.
- Fredrick, P. (2010). Employees' turnover repercussions. *Journal of management*, 6.
- Irungu, L. N., Njongoro, M., &Kariuki, E. (2019) Influence of recruitment and selection approaches on staff retention in faith- based organizations: A case of ACK Kibera paper project, Kibra Sub-County in Nairobi County. *TheStrategic Journal of Business & Change Management*, 6(1), 1 – 16.
- Kothari, C., &Garg, G. (2014). Research methodology: Methods and Techniques, Third edit. ed. *New age international (p) limited, publishers.*
- Maxwell, F. (2010).Employees' Turnover and organization efficiency. *Journal of Personnel Management*,18.
- Ntiamoah, E., Abrokwah, E., Agyei-Sakyi, M., Opoku, B., &Siaw, A. (2014).An investigation into recruitment and selection practices and organizational performance. *International Journal of Economics, Commerce and Management*, 2(11), 1-11.
- Owoyemi, O. A.,Oyelere,M.,Elegbede,T.,&Gbajumo-Sheriff, M.(2011). *Enhancing Employees' Commitment to Organizations through Training.International Journal of Business and Management*, (9)10-15.
- Paul Battaglio Jr, R., &Condrey, S. E. (2009). Reforming public management: Analyzing the impact of public service reform on organizational and managerial trust. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 19(4), 689-707.
- Phillips, J. J. (2009). *Accountability in human resource management: connecting HR to business results*. Routledge.
- Premeaux, P. (2000). Employees' Turnover and organization efficiency. *Journal of Management*, 10.
- Ramki, S. (2015). *Effect of recruitment and selection practises on retention of teachers in international*.
- Samuel, M. O., &Chipunza, C. (2009). Employee retention and turnover: Using motivational variables as a panacea. *African journal of business management*, 3(9), 410-415.
- Sutanto, E.M., &Kurniawan, M. (2016).The impact of recruitment, employee retention and labor relations to employee performance on batik industry in Solo city.